Early Childhood Compensation Parity in 2 US Cities

WELCOME
Jennifer March, Ph.D.
Executive Director of Citizens’ Committee for Children of New York

Sarah Baray, Ph.D.
Chief Executive Officer of Pre-K4
San Antonio
Discussion Question #1

Please take just a few minutes and describe the workforce landscape in San Antonio and NYC in terms of standards, compensation, demographics and unions across the child care, PreK and Head Start systems.
Pay disparity among CBO and DOE teachers widens over time according to the most recent UFT Teachers Contracts and DC 1707 Contract.
Publicly funded: **Voucher and Contracted**

123,666 children under 5 enrolled:
- 91,019 in contracted seats (DOE or ACS)
- 32,647 using vouchers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>By Age Groups</th>
<th>Infants</th>
<th>Toddlers</th>
<th>3-year-olds</th>
<th>4-year-olds</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5,728</td>
<td>8,809</td>
<td>12,200</td>
<td>5,919</td>
<td>68,161</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>By Modality</th>
<th>Center</th>
<th>School</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Informal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14,076</td>
<td>30,705</td>
<td>13,989</td>
<td>4,582</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Services: publicly funded: city-contracted (subsidized, Pre-K and 3-K) and vouchers
Children under 5 served in city-contracted early childhood care and education system:

Modality share of the total number of children in each age group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Center</th>
<th>Family</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4-year-olds</td>
<td>55.3%</td>
<td>44.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-year-olds</td>
<td>77.7%</td>
<td>18.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toddlers</td>
<td>30.2%</td>
<td>69.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infants</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
<td>90.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Services: city-contracted (subsidized, Pre-K and 3-K)

More than 50% of 4-year-olds are in center-based Pre-K classrooms
UNDERSTANDING THE LANDSCAPE

Texas

Children
- 7.4 million (1 out of every 10 children in the US)
- Most live in one of 6 large metro regions (1 million+)
- 23% live in poverty; 51% low-income (0-200% FPL)
- 67% children of color

Early Care & Learning
- 5,000 licensed centers
- 89% of providers not certified for quality (QRIS)
- 130,000 children in subsidized care

San Antonio

Children
- 141,168 children under the age of 5
- Spread out over 500 sq miles
- 30% live in poverty; 55% low-income (0-200% FPL)
- 80% children of color

Early Care & Learning
- 621 licensed centers
- 78% of providers not certified for quality (QRIS)
- 8,446 children in subsidized care
Both of your cities have worked for pay parity in the early care and education field. By pay parity I mean early childhood educators with similar education are paid on par with K-12 teachers working in your city’s school system. Please describe where you have made achievement. Who gets it and who doesn’t?
## San Antonio Early Childhood Education System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Governing Agency</th>
<th>Funding</th>
<th>Who is served</th>
<th># Served</th>
<th>Pay Parity</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Head Start</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public Schools</td>
<td>State Dept of Education</td>
<td>Property Tax</td>
<td>Eligible 4-year olds - full day</td>
<td>13,000 +</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>BA Continuing Education</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Eligible 3-year olds - ½ day</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community-Based Organizations</td>
<td>State Dept of Family Protective Services</td>
<td>Private pay Workforce subsidies</td>
<td>0-5 year olds</td>
<td>41,500</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>HS diploma 24 hrs pre-service training</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-K 4 SA</td>
<td>Municipal Government</td>
<td>1/8 cent Sales Tax</td>
<td>4 year olds - combination of eligible and tuition-based</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>YES+ (15% above)</td>
<td>BA 150 hrs of ECE continuing education annually</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

[Pre-K4-S4 Logo]

*Early Inspiration, Future Success.*
In July 2019, the city announced a tentative agreement to increase pay for certified teachers at CBOs over three years:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Increase Schedule</th>
<th>With Master’s Degree</th>
<th>With Bachelor’s Degree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>October 1, 2019</td>
<td>$53,581</td>
<td>$48,372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 1, 2020</td>
<td>$62,295</td>
<td>$55,651</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 1, 2021</td>
<td>$68,652 ($20,784 more than previous rate)</td>
<td>$61,070 ($17,435 more than previous rate)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The deal would also bring down out of pocket health insurance costs for CBO staff by reducing their premiums and co-pays.
How did this happen? What have been the disrupters for change? Was there a crisis, like high levels of turnover or the unavailability of care? New data on the workforce and compensation disparity? Better organized advocacy? OR a change in leadership or new dynamic leadership? OR A new initiative like Pre-K that needed a better paid, better educated workforce?
The Road to Salary Parity in New York City

- District 1707 was acquired by DC 37, bringing increased political clout and bargaining acumen to the negotiating table
- City Council made public commitment that the budget would not be adopted without parity in the early education workforce
- Aggressive PR Campaign – 60 press hits in the six month period and consistent social media storytelling
Media Highlights

- City Limits – Worries About Pay Equity As New Era Dawns for Early Childhood Programs
- Gotham Gazette Op Ed – A Fairer New York City Requires Salary Parity for the Early Childhood Workforce
- Wall Street Journal – New York City Preschool Teachers Mull Strike as Union Discusses Pay
- Chalkbeat – City Council Demanding Higher Pre-K Wages and it could lead to a budget showdown
Pre-K 4 SA
San Antonio’s Investment in Early Learning

Setting the Standard
Developing Teachers
Raising Quality
Increasing Demand

EDUCATION CENTERS
PROFESSIONAL LEARNING
COMPETITIVE GRANTS
FAMILY ENGAGEMENT
Pre-K 4 SA – Cost-Benefit Study

Pre-K 4 SA Returns $59 Million in Benefits to SA in First 8 Years

Source: “Benefit-Cost Analysis of Pre-K 4 SA” by University of Pennsylvania, Teachers College at Columbia University, and Westat
Discussion Question #4

Given the COVID 19 crisis and the significant disruption in our early education system and economy, what’s next on your agenda for moving compensation and the system forward?
COVID-19 AS A LEVERAGE POINT

Early Matters Coalition

Frontline Childcare Task Force

City of Dallas
Your Questions and Comments?