Compensation Strategies in the States: Evidence from the *Early Childhood Workforce Index*

Caitlin McLean, Ph.D.
Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
University of California, Berkeley

April 27, 2017, 2017 Moving the Needle on Compensation National Summit
2 million adults are paid to educate and care for more than 12 million children between birth and age five.

98% of ECE teachers in centers are women.

1,000,000 Center-based staff

115,000 Home-based listed Typically small businesses

919,000 Home-based unlisted Typically individual providers
Hourly wages depend more on where early educators work than on their qualifications.

Among center-based teachers with a BA:

- **25%** of infant and toddler teachers with bachelor’s or higher degrees earned $15 or more per hour.
- **50%** of teachers working with 3-5 year olds earned at least $15.50 per hour.

**Working in School-Based Centers**
The median early educator hourly wage in school-sponsored settings in state-funded pre-K programs is about $20.

**Working in Other Centers**
The median for early educators in all other centers is $15 or less.
Economic Insecurity

46% of Child Care Workers, nearly two thirds of whom work full-time, and their families participate in public support programs like the Earned Income Tax Credit, Medicaid, or food stamps.

This is nearly double the rate for all families and more than triple the rate for elementary and middle school teachers.
Worthy Work, Still Unlivable Wages
How We Pay The Least to the Teachers We Need the Most

My Teacher Helps Me Learn,
But Struggles To Pay For Food


© Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
“Adults who are under-informed, underprepared, or subject to chronic stress themselves may contribute to children’s experiences of adversity and stress and undermine their development and learning.”

“It is through the quality work of these adults that the nation can make it right from the very beginning for all of its children....”

YOU'RE NOT WORTH YOUR PUBLIC UNION WAGES!

YOU'RE NOT WORTH YOUR UNION PENSION AND HEALTH CARE!

WHICH IS WHY I'M GONNA...

...ENTRUST YOU WITH THE MOST PRECIOUS THING IN THE WORLD TO ME.
Chart PF3.1.B. Public spending on early childhood education and care per child
Public expenditure on childcare per child aged 0-2, public expenditure on pre-primary education per child aged 3-5, and total public expenditure on early childhood education and care per child aged 0-5, in USD PPP, 2013 and latest available

[Graph showing data for different countries]
State of the Early Childhood Workforce Initiative: Overview

Read the Early Childhood Workforce Index: tiny.cc/ECIndex

Salary parity for pre-K teachers
ECE workforce role stratification
Cost estimates & financing mechanisms
Minimum wage laws & ECE policy
ECE workforce data sources
Organizing & advocacy efforts

© Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
Early Childhood Workforce Index 2016

Earnings & Economic Security

Early Childhood Workforce Policies

Family & Income Support Policies

Stalled

Edging Forward

Making Headway

© Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
Guide to indicators

Earnings
- Preschool Teachers

Early Childhood Workforce Policies

Family & Income Support Policies

Percent changes in median wages 2010-2015
- Unavailable
- Decrease
- No Change
- Increase <10%
- Increase 10 to <20%
- Increase ≥20%
Making Headway: 5 Essential Elements of Early Childhood Workforce Policy
Compensation Strategies

Salary Parity for Pre-K Teachers

Wage Supplement

© Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, 2016
In Pursuit of Pre-K Parity:
A Proposed Framework for Understanding and Advancing Policy and Practice

By Marcy Whitebook, Ph.D. and Caitlin McLean, Ph.D.

Project Description: This brief is the first in a series of materials on pre-K compensation parity, jointly undertaken by the Center for the Study of Child Care Employment and the National Institute for Early Education Research. This first brief evolved out of CSCCE’s work for the State of the Early Childhood Workforce Initiative, a multi-year project to shine a steady spotlight on our nation’s early childhood workforce. In addition to the Early Childhood Workforce Index, the initiative consists of further resources for advocates, policymakers, and other stakeholders.

Summary: Many pre-K teachers across the nation are expected to earn a bachelor’s degree, similar to their peers teaching older children. Yet salaries and benefits remain consistently lower for pre-K teachers than for elementary school teachers. Increasingly, compensation parity is perceived as an achievable policy goal rather than a lofty ideal, yet there is confusion across the field about what parity means. This brief develops a framework for understanding compensation parity in contrast to other forms of compensation improvement. Applying this framework to current state efforts to move toward compensation parity reveals a great deal of variability across states. While some states approach compensation parity, at least for some pre-K teachers, and several states have pursued parity in salaries only, the majority of states do not have any explicit policies intended to move toward parity for pre-K teachers.

Key Findings:
- Compensation parity is defined as parity with K-3 teachers for salary and benefits for equivalent levels of education and experience, prorated to reflect differences in hours of work in private settings, where applicable, and including payment for non-child contact hours (such as paid time for planning).
- Only one state has compensation parity policies that apply to all pre-K lead and assistant teachers, but their pre-K program is delivered via public schools only.
- Ten states have compensation parity policies that include salary, benefits, and payment for professional responsibilities, at least for lead pre-K teachers in public schools.
- Eighteen states have policies in place with the goal of meeting salary parity, but only 14 states have policies that meet our criteria of salary parity, with equivalent starting salary and salary schedules, prorated.

http://cscce.berkeley.edu/topic/state-of-the-early-childhood-workforce/pre-k-parity/
Wage Supplements

Twelve states have a statewide stipend program, such as WAGE$.

Two states offer ECE teacher tax credits.
Guide to indicators

About The Index

How The Index Works

Earnings

Early Childhood Workforce Policies
- Qualifications
- QRIS & work environments
- Compensation strategies
- Financial resources
- Workforce data

Family & Income Support Policies

Early Childhood Workforce Policies
Compensation strategies

© Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
Making Headway: 5 Essential Elements of Early Childhood Workforce Policy

- Qualifications
- Workforce Data
- Work Environments
- Compensation
- Financial Resources

© Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
Spotlight Example: Illinois

In Illinois, the Workforce Compensation Subcommittee was convened in 2014 to address compensation parity within the ECE workforce. The subcommittee developed a number of recommendations, including:

- “Ensure that all new requests for federal early childhood funding include allocations for bachelor’s-level teaching and administrative staff salaries”;
- “Require 80 percent of all rate enhancements and quality incentives, regardless of funding source, be budgeted for compensation”; and
- Adjust “reimbursement rates and contracts, and quality financial incentives to allow for incremental increases in minimum staff salaries.”
In *Washington*, the Department of Early Learning is directed by the legislature to use existing data to make biennial recommendations on compensation models for the early childhood workforce. Among the recommendations in its 2015 report:

- “Continue to collect verified compensation data for early learning professionals. Based on this data, create a recommended teacher salary scale for both licensed child care and state-funded preschool.”
- “Build on the cost study completed in 2013 which modeled the cost of quality in Early Achievers. Update the cost study with a national entity to verify the costs associated with quality, including tiered reimbursement rates.”
Spurring Advocacy & Action

Policy Recommendations

● Establish a minimum educational requirement that reflects foundational knowledge for all early educators

● Develop workplace standards, such as paid planning time, which are necessary for educators to engage in professional practice

● Identify guidelines for compensation levels to raise the wage floor and move toward parity

● Commit to securing dedicated, sustainable funds

● Continue to develop comprehensive, up-to-date workforce data systems

http://cscce.berkeley.edu/early-childhood-workforce-index/
Moving the Needle on Compensation
Combating Myths

“Providing early care and education is a low-skilled job”

“The market will handle it”

“Teachers are paid in love”

“It’s too expensive”
Making the **Economic Case** for Better Compensation

“ECE jobs don’t go overseas”

“Our communities - parents and employers - rely on child care”
Making the **Equity Case for Better Compensation**

“All children deserve high-quality early care and education”

“All early educators should be able to do their jobs without worrying about buying food”
Conducting research and proposing policy solutions aimed at improving how our nation prepares, supports, and rewards the early care and education workforce since 1999.

Read the report: tiny.cc/ECIndex