What We Talk About When We Talk About Compensation

T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood
2018 Symposium

Lauren Hogan, NAEYC
During the April 2018 Oklahoma teacher walkout, “many parents [showed] their unyielding support of the movement, noting that teachers were not just demanding a pay raise for themselves, but also funding for better textbooks and classroom supplies.”

- "My kids are worth it, my teachers are worth it. My state is worth it."

- “The walkout is a ‘little inconvenient, but nothing in comparison to what our teachers face every day in underfunded classrooms and abysmal salaries.’”
Importance of Early Childhood Educators

Voters view teaching young children as important work.

National Association for the Education of Young Children
EDUCATORS ARE heroes!

Nearly 90% of voters say early childhood educators are important members of their communities, on par with firefighters and nurses.
## Components of ECE Programs Recognized as Important for Ensuring Quality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Has patient and compassionate teachers</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasizes language and literacy</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotes positive social and emotional development</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasizes math skills and problem solving</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has teachers who meet state and local standards</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has teachers who are well-compensated</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has teachers and staff with degrees in child development and/or early childhood education</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keeps a low student-to-teacher ratio</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Voters recognize the connection between early childhood educators and quality—including compensation and degrees.
Most voters believe that early childhood educators are paid too little.
QUALITY IS TIED TO compensation

Voters agree: Early childhood educators are paid too little and their wages should be raised.
Voters overwhelmingly support increasing funding for ECE services.

Voters overwhelmingly support increasing funding for ECE services.
Support for Increased ECE Funding by Party

Majorities of Democrats, Independents, and Republicans support increased investment in early childhood education.

National Association for the Education of Young Children
Support for Increased ECE Funding by Ethnicity

African-American voters are among the most supportive of an investment in ECE.

95%

African-American voters are among the most supportive of an investment in ECE.
There is a pronounced gender gap, particularly among voters over age 50.

Support for Increased ECE Funding by Gender/Age

- Men 50+
- Women 50+
- Men 18–49
- Women 18–49

Total Oppose  DK/NA  Total Support

National Association for the Education of Young Children
Investment in Educators

Voters support an investment in ECE with the understanding that it would increase wages. 83%
INVEST IN
early childhood

83% of voters would support a public investment in early childhood education that is used to increase educators’ wages.
## Importance of Increasing Wages Across Settings

A majority of voters support raising wages for early educators across all settings, but there are differences.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Support (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Those who work in communities with limited access to early education</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those who work at public schools</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those who work in pre-schools with three- and four-year-olds</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those who work in low-income communities</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those with higher levels of education and training</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those who work in non-profit centers</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those who work with infants and toddlers under age three</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those who work in home-based programs</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Does a rising tide lift all boats?

The nature of policy implementation necessitates questions of priority and sequence. Even if we are ultimately aiming to lift all boats, we have to determine whose boats get lifted first and in what order? Does one body of water need to shrink or remain stagnant in order to allow a different one to grow?

In other words, compensation for who?
Power to the Profession
What We Need and Want

- Significant public investment
- **Comparable compensation**
- Effective practices
- Diverse professionals at all levels
- High-quality and accessible preparation programs
- Professional autonomy
- Profession-led policies
- Professional respect and status
What the Public Needs to Know

• Who?
• What?
• Why?
• How?
What We Have:
Internal & External Confusion

National Association for the Education of Young Children
What We Have:
Internal & External Confusion

- Varying nomenclature
- Varying competencies
- Varying preparation programs
- Varying qualifications
- Varying compensation
- Varying working conditions
- Varying expectations for practice
- Varying accountability
Unifying Identity Matters

Power to the Profession is a national collaboration to establish a shared ownership and framework for career pathways, knowledge and competencies, qualifications, standards of practice, and compensation that unifies the entire early childhood education profession, ages birth through 8, across all settings and states.
The Big Idea

If the Profession Develops a Unifying Framework to Define Their Work
2017-18

And Jointly Advocates for the Unifying Framework
2019

Federal, State, and Local Policies & Funding Will Support Implementation of the Unifying Framework
2020-2025

Then We Can Recruit and Retain Effective, Diverse, and Well-Compensated Early Childhood Educators
2020 and Beyond

And Increase Access to High-Quality Early Childhood Education for All Young Children
2020 and Beyond

As the Profession Commits to Continuously Improving the Framework

Note: Dates reflect initial development and implementation
How we get there

A Three-Pronged Approach

Image Campaign ‘Discover Nursing’ (Begins 2018)

Power to the Profession (2017-2018)

Policy Adoption and Financing Agenda (Begins 2018)
How do we get there?
8 Decision Cycles
(January 2017 – December 2018)

1. Professional Identity and Boundary
2. Competencies (General)
3. Competencies (Specialized)
4. Competency Attainment Source
5. Qualifications and Pathways
6. Compensation Recommendation
7. Required Accountability and Quality Assurance
8. Required Support and Infrastructure

Transition to Finalizing and Implementing Policy and Financing Agenda
Early Childhood Education Profession

- Pedagogical & Instructional Administrators
- Early Childhood Educators
- Higher Education Faculty
- Business or Operations Administrators
- Individuals Not Meeting Professional Qualifications
- Home Visitors
- Mental Health Consultants
- Policy or Advocacy Specialists
- Children's Librarians
- Pediatrists
- & many more!
P2P Core Motivation: Emphasize compensation

Low compensation undermines quality. Power to the Profession’s ultimate goal is to achieve significant and sustained public investments that are directed towards the education and compensation of the early childhood profession.
Parents, Educators, and Voters: All Together Now
Parents and educators believe in shared responsibility for ensuring funding to make high-quality ECE available to all children.

Q34. Here is a list of individuals and organizations that could be responsible for ensuring there is funding to make high-quality early childhood education available to all children. Please tell me how responsible you think that individual or organization should be for helping to provide such funding: one of the most responsible, very responsible, somewhat responsible or not responsible.

(One of the Most Responsible)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individuals/Organizations</th>
<th>Parents</th>
<th>Educators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State government</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal government</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local governments</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School districts</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxpayers generally</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious institutions and non-profit organizations</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q34. Here is a list of individuals and organizations that could be responsible for ensuring there is funding to make high-quality early childhood education available to all children. Please tell me how responsible you think that individual or organization should be for helping to provide such funding: one of the most responsible, very responsible, somewhat responsible or not responsible.
Political ideology yields different perspectives on the role of government, but not on the role of parents. Approximately 40% of conservative, moderate, and liberal parents believe they should be one of the most responsible for funding early childhood education, with a shared role for local, state, and federal government.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individuals/Organizations</th>
<th>Parents</th>
<th>Liberal</th>
<th>Moderate</th>
<th>Conservative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State government</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal government</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School districts</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local governments</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxpayers generally</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious institutions and non-profit organizations</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
With reforms and better training, we can increase the quality of early childhood education without raising costs for parents. Any major effort to increase the quality of early childhood education programs will result in parents paying more.
Any major effort to increase the quality of early childhood education programs will fail unless early educators receive increased salaries and benefits.

With reforms and better training, we can increase the quality of early childhood education without increasing salaries and benefits for early educators.
Voters see several compelling reasons to support wage increases for early childhood educators.

(% Very Convincing)

**BRAIN DEVELOPMENT** Research shows that a child’s brain develops most dramatically during the first five years of life. This critical period is a window of opportunity to lay the foundation for all of the years that follow. It takes appropriate salaries and benefits to recruit and retain the best educators to work with our children during this critical period of their development.

61%

**ROLE MODELS** Early childhood educators are role models in the lives of the children they serve. Educators support children’s natural curiosity, help them solve problems, provide them with comfort, help them make new friends, follow rules, set boundaries, be an example in their lives and have fun.

58%

**SCHOOL READINESS** Paying our early childhood educators fairly will improve the quality of preschools, which will strengthen K-12 education. Studies show that kids who go to pre-school are better prepared to learn, more likely to read by the fourth grade and more likely to graduate and go on to college.

58%
Florida Early Learning Compensation Survey

• With thanks to The Children’s Forum!
• Requested ELC, CSC, and statewide association leadership administer the survey to their boards and membership.
• 106 surveys completed in Fall 2017.
• 59 counties represented
• Professions varied; some were within and some were outside of ECE
• Highlight importance of shared questions
  • Create nationwide understanding and ability to assess differences
Florida: A Bird’s Eye View

- 76% support directing public funds toward compensation initiatives.
- 26% say compensation strategies have been implemented in their community.
- Over 90% agreed that: *Increasing wages for early childhood educators will benefit all of us by reducing turnover, attracting more qualified teachers to the field, and strengthening the quality of early education programs across the state resulting in better outcomes for children*
### Florida: Messages With Least Consistent Responses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Messaging</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any effort to increase wages for early childhood educators will drive up costs for families; disproportionately affecting access to quality early childhood education for poor, rural, and minority communities.</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investing public money toward increased wages for early childhood educators will lead to more bureaucracy, regulation, and government interference in early education. That's not the way to improve the system.</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increasing wages for early childhood educators will drive up costs of early education programs for families and/or increase costs to taxpayers.</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What hourly pay rate is most reasonable for early childhood educators?

- Responses demonstrated that those within our field think a reasonable hourly rate for educators working with infants and toddlers should be lower than that for educators working with 3- and 4- year olds ($14.78 vs. $15.76)

- In both cases, $15 was the most frequently chosen option
  - Power of suggestion (minimum wage fights have focused on $15/hour)
  - Is this where we want to put a stake in the ground?
Voters are more likely to call early childhood educators “extremely important” after messaging. This is more than semantics. Your engaged voters are your folks who think their issue is “extremely important.”
Helping People Act.
Some people say that the only way to expand access to high-quality early childhood programs is for parents to be involved in the political process and advocate for it. Please indicate how interested you might be in getting more personally involved in advocating for increased access to high-quality early childhood education. Please use a scale from 0 to 100, where 0 means you have no interest at all and 100 means you are extremely interested, with 50 being neutral.

Educators and parents are both willing to advocate for ECE.

Educators
- 26% for 0-50
- 24% for 51-74
- 26% for 75-90
- 24% for 91-100

Mean Score: 69.1

Parents
- 25% for 0-50
- 27% for 51-74
- 27% for 75-90
- 20% for 91-100

Mean Score: 67.3
Educators are almost universally willing to cast a pro-ECE vote or talk to friends about early learning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Educators</th>
<th>Parents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Voting for a candidate or ballot measure who supported early childhood education</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talking to friends and family about supporting early childhood education</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buying something where some of the money goes to supporting early childhood education</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wearing a t-shirt or bracelet with a slogan supporting early childhood education</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signing an online petition</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sending an email or other communication to a public figure or organization</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing, re-sharing, or clicking “like” on an article or image on Facebook, or another online platform</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q23. Please indicate how willing you would be to take each of the following actions to help to advocate for increased access to high-quality early childhood education in your community. *Not Part of Split Sample
Among educators, the groups most willing to advocate include:

- African-Americans and Latinos
- Strong liberals/Democrats
- Under age 40
- Income below $60,000

There are large differences by ideology (mean score for “very liberal” is 79 compared to 55 for “very conservative”).

Small differences by tenure in ECE, job type, ages served, and program type
The strongest messages to encourage educator advocacy focus on the importance of the profession.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Messages</th>
<th>Very Convincing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>(GROWING IMPORTANCE)</em> The awareness of the importance of early childhood education is growing every day. More people are recognizing that we must do more to support babies, toddlers, preschoolers and their families. Early educators must take that message to policy makers and make sure that early learning programs have the funding and support they need.</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>(POWERFUL VOICE)</em> If early educators speak up, people will listen. 88% of U.S. voters say that early childhood educators are important contributors to their community. As the experts on early learning, educators should use their powerful voice to fight for policy changes to make quality early learning available for all children.</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q24. Here are a series of statements from people who are urging early educators to get more personally involved in advocating for increased access to high-quality early learning programs. Please indicate whether you find it very convincing as a reason to get more involved in advocating for early learning, somewhat convincing, or not convincing.
A message around increased compensation in isolation is less compelling.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Messages</th>
<th>Very Convincing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(DON’T WAIT FOR SOMEONE ELSE) For decades, early childhood educators have known that they should be compensated more fairly and that more should be done to improve the availability of quality early learning programs. But far too often, educators look for someone else to carry that message to policy makers. Early educators cannot wait any longer. It is time for them to speak up and fight for what they know is right.</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(QUALITY) Despite the work of educators and others, the quality of early learning programs in America is simply not what it needs to be. Educators need to push policy makers to provide more funding to improve the quality and help programs reach their potential.</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(COMPENSATION) The only way early educators will ever receive fair compensation is by advocating to local, state and federal elected officials who control how much funding goes to early learning programs. If educators do more to demand funding for early learning, it will move the system towards getting them the salaries and benefits they deserve.</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q24. Here are a series of statements from people who are urging early educators to get more personally involved in advocating for increased access to high-quality early learning programs. Please indicate whether you find it very convincing as a reason to get more involved in advocating for early learning, somewhat convincing, or not convincing.
“We have an experiment of helping a starving child. A certain percentage of people help [by donating money to the kid]. Then we have another condition with a different group, same child, same situation, except we put the numbers of the statistics of starvation next to her picture, and the donations dropped in half. We call it pseudo-inefficacy because it happens to people who actually can make a difference. They don't act because it doesn't feel worthwhile, or they don't think it's worthwhile.

It's not enough to break through the numbing. You have to give people somewhere to go. You have to have some action options that they can take.”

- Paul Slovic, psychologist, University of Oregon
Let’s Talk Strategy
Get On the Train That’s Moving

• Child Care Deserts
• Job Guarantees
• PreK Expansion
• Caregiving Economy
• Increased Educational Requirements

• Minimum Wage Increases
• Economic Justice
• Teacher Walkouts
• Apprenticeships
• Others?
…But Don’t Get Thrown Off

• What are the opportunities and challenges TO INCREASE COMPENSATION?

• In order to maximize the opportunities and minimize the challenges…
  • What messages could you deploy? Where?
  • Using which messengers?
  • What does that tell you about the relationships you need to be strengthening now?
Example: Child Care Deserts

• Opportunities:
  • Could put parents & educators on same side of demanding investment in child care
  • Opens door to make the case for increasing salaries as a market response to need for providers

• Challenges:
  • Could put parents and educators on opposite side of demanding investment in child care, where parents focus on affordability and educators focus on compensation
  • Opens door to make the case for decreasing regulations as a market response to need for providers
Example: Child Care Deserts

• Messengers / Messages:
  • Parents, K-12 educators, Principals, Superintendents, Companies / Employers
    • Importance of **quality**, not just **availability**
    • Importance of compensation as driver of quality
    • Results of regulation / Dangers of deregulation
Discuss & Report Out

• Child Care Deserts
• Job Guarantees
• PreK Expansion
• Caregiving Economy
• Increased Educational Requirements
• Minimum Wage Increases
• Economic Justice
• Teacher Walkouts
• Apprenticeships
• Others?

1. Opportunities to increase compensation
2. Challenges to increase compensation
   In order to maximize the opportunities and minimize the challenges…
3. What messages do you want to use?
4. To whom do you want to convey those messages?
5. Using which messengers?
6. What does that tell you about the relationships you need to be strengthening now?
Thank you

Lauren Hogan
Senior Director, Public Policy & Advocacy, NAEYC
lhogan@naeyc.org
202-350-8837